

**PROCEEDINGS OF PERSONNEL COMMITTEE
WEST BLOOMFIELD TOWN HALL
4550 WALNUT LAKE ROAD
CONFERENCE ROOM 75/76
TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 23, 2010 – 12:30 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

Trustee Larry Brown called the meeting to order at 12:32 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Members present: Trustee Larry Brown
Trustee Steve Kaplan
Trustee Howard Rosenberg

Members absent: None

Staff Present: Denise Maier, Human Resources Director
Marya Duncan, Human Resources Specialist

General Public: Teri Weingarden, Township Treasurer
Cathy Shaughnessy, Township Clerk
Ed Haapala, Water & Sewer Director

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Brown asked that Item 6.b. regarding Consideration to fill full-time Code Enforcement Officer Position from within due to upcoming retirement, including proposed change to certification requirement on job description with additional discussion regarding part-time Plan Reviewer position(s) be removed from the agenda.

Motion by Mr. Rosenberg and supported by Mr. Brown to approve the agenda as amended with the removal of Item 6.b.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion carried

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Mr. Rosenberg and supported by Mr. Brown to approve the 01/20/10 minutes as presented.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion carried

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

NEW BUSINESS

CONSIDERATION OF TREASURER AND WATER & SEWER DEPARTMENTS PROPOSED SUCCESSION PLAN DUE TO UPCOMING RETIREMENTS ~ (1) REVIEW AND CONSIDERATION OF NEW JOB DESCRIPTION FOR TREASURER'S BILLING CLERK (COMBINATION OF TWO EXISTING JOB DESCRIPTIONS, TREASURER'S ACCOUNT CLERK AND W/S BILLING CLERK)

Mr. Haapala stated there were two retirements occurring this year; a part-time Account Clerk in the Treasurer's Office and a full-time Water & Sewer Billing Analyst in the Water & Sewer Department. The Account Clerk position is 30 hours per week and the Water & Sewer Department pays 50% of the salary, which is at pay grade level 4.

Mr. Brown asked when the individual in the Account Clerk position would be retiring. Mr. Haapala replied that Sue Donovan would be retiring on April 1st. He stated that the retirement package for the employee in this position would be paid 50/50 by both the Water & Sewer Department and General Fund.

Mr. Haapala stated the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst position handles approximately \$22 million in billing. The position is at pay grade level 4.5 and Barb Kula would be retiring in July. He stated that the retirement package for the employee in this position would be paid entirely by the Water & Sewer Department.

Mr. Haapala stated the Account Clerk position in the Treasurer's Office was becoming more heavily laden with Water & Sewer Department functions. The current employee served as back-up during instances in which one or both of the Water & Sewer Billing Analysts were absent due to vacation or illness.

**CONSIDERATION OF TREASURER AND WATER & SEWER DEPARTMENTS
PROPOSED SUCCESSION PLAN DUE TO UPCOMING RETIREMENTS ~ (1)
REVIEW AND CONSIDERATION OF NEW JOB DESCRIPTION FOR TREASURER'S
BILLING CLERK (COMBINATION OF TWO EXISTING JOB DESCRIPTIONS,
TREASURER'S ACCOUNT CLERK AND W/S BILLING CLERK)** (Continued)

Mr. Haapala stated the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst position is very crucial in the Water & Sewer Department. He asked that the Committee consider a replacement prior to the departure of Barb Kula because training time was necessary to get the next individual grounded and knowledgeable with the new BS & A software. He stated that the department was seeking a very customer service oriented individual to fill the position and felt it could be filled in-house.

Mr. Haapala stated he wanted to conduct interviews in June and have an individual begin on July 1st to allow him adequate time to get the individual properly integrated into the department.

Mr. Haapala stated the Account Clerk position previously handled a lot of the transmission and capital charges on water and sewer usage. However, as development has slowed down, that task is not done as much as the clerk duties such as data input of information into the computer system. He stated that approximately $\frac{3}{4}$ of this position could be justifiable under the Water & Sewer Department.

Mr. Brown asked if he was looking for a part-time replacement. Mr. Haapala replied, "No, the discussion was for a full-time position." A full-time position still affords the opportunity for the same amount of level of pay and therefore, it would not change the numbers in the General Fund. He stated that typically, he has seen three to four Billing Analysts for a municipality of the Township's size. Currently, there are only two Billing Analysts. The accounts have tripled and the two analysts are taking on the same workload.

Mr. Haapala stated the benefit is that currently, there is a Water & Sewer Billing Supervisor at pay grade level 7 and when the individual in that position retires the position would not be replaced.

Mr. Rosenberg stated that could not be counted now. He indicated that he was not in favor of spending more money now and possibly have savings two years from now. He stated that Mr. Haapala is asking to spend additional money to hire an individual 30 days in advance to replace the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst. He asked for the additional cost for training. Mr. Haapala stated it would be approximately \$4,000.

Mr. Rosenberg stated that additionally, he was asking to increase a part-time position to full-time, which involved spending more money and he could not support that

request. However, it made sense to hire an individual a few weeks early and therefore, he could support that.

**CONSIDERATION OF TREASURER AND WATER & SEWER DEPARTMENTS
PROPOSED SUCCESSION PLAN DUE TO UPCOMING RETIREMENTS ~ (1)
REVIEW AND CONSIDERATION OF NEW JOB DESCRIPTION FOR TREASURER'S
BILLING CLERK (COMBINATION OF TWO EXISTING JOB DESCRIPTIONS,
TREASURER'S ACCOUNT CLERK AND W/S BILLING CLERK)** (Continued)

Ms. Weingarden stated there was discussion related to succession planning. She stated that Suzette Page, who is currently in the Switchboard position worked out very well in the Treasurer's Department when she provided assistance during the tax season.

Ms. Weingarden stated that previously she could not hire a part-time employee, but with all the retirements and backfilling of positions that would be occurring, she felt a part-time individual would be absorbed.

Ms. Weingarden stated the attempt was to integrate both the Treasurer's Office and Water & Sewer Department to allow each department to serve as back-up for each other during absences.

Mr. Kaplan asked if a 30-hour employee received benefits. Ms. Maier replied, "No, only Multivestor." Mr. Kaplan asked if the Township has historically allowed employees to begin working in a position prior to the predecessor's departure. Ms. Maier stated that she worked alongside Kent Herbert prior to his departure. Ms. Duncan stated that typically, by the time an individual is hired, the predecessor has already left.

Mr. Haapala stated that he was simply notifying the Committee in advance to allow for the opportunity to plan for succession. Mr. Kaplan stated the problem is that the Township is not budgeted for paying two employees in one month. Mr. Rosenberg agreed.

Mr. Rosenberg stated the concept of succession planning which he has seen across the board in other departments is not within the spirit of an open hiring policy. He stated that there cannot be individuals in mind for a specific position because that is unfair and discriminatory.

Ms. Weingarden stated she wanted to fill the part-time Account Clerk position and Mr. Haapala wanted to fill the full-time Water & Sewer Billing Analyst position. Mr. Kaplan stated the other issue is to have an individual hired two to three weeks prior to the departure of the current Water & Sewer Billing Analyst. Mr. Haapala stated that it would certainly be a great step forward and allow for proper training.

**CONSIDERATION OF TREASURER AND WATER & SEWER DEPARTMENTS
PROPOSED SUCCESSION PLAN DUE TO UPCOMING RETIREMENTS ~ (1)
REVIEW AND CONSIDERATION OF NEW JOB DESCRIPTION FOR TREASURER'S
BILLING CLERK (COMBINATION OF TWO EXISTING JOB DESCRIPTIONS,
TREASURER'S ACCOUNT CLERK AND W/S BILLING CLERK)** (Continued)

Ms. Shaughnessy stated that individuals cannot be hand-picked and all positions, part-time and full-time, need to be posted for a period of eight (8) days and all in-house employees who are qualified are eligible to apply for those positions.

Mr. Brown stated that the Board has spent an enormous amount of time attempting to cut costs and now there is discussion of replacing positions.

Mr. Rosenberg stated the Committee and ultimately, the Township Board has to make a decision as to whether jobs are critical to the function of the township. He agreed that both positions were necessary.

Mr. Brown expressed concern that only one-third is being saved and indicated that the township will be \$3.6 million short this coming year.

Mr. Haapala stated the Water & Sewer Department runs anywhere between \$20 to \$22 million in revenues annually. The expenditures are \$18 to \$20 million and \$2.2 million is banked. Mr. Brown stated that amount could be used for infrastructure.

Ms. Weingarden stated that Ms. Maier has been working on a priority list of the positions that need to be replaced.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated the alternative to hiring outside is that the Board has the authority to reassign or transfer employees from departments.

Ms. Maier asked that if an individual at pay grade level 4.0 applies for the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst position at pay grade level 4.5, does that individual remain at level 4.0. Mr. Brown stated that the individual would be hired at pay grade level 4.5, but at the bottom of that pay grade level.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated that through attrition, it is an opportunity for the Personnel Committee and the Township Board to review pay grade levels. Mr. Brown stated there needed to be direction from the Board and the union should be part of that discussion.

Mr. Kaplan stated that he was not in favor of reviewing the pay grade for the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst position because he felt it was a specialized position that should remain at pay grade level 4.5.

**CONSIDERATION OF TREASURER AND WATER & SEWER DEPARTMENTS
PROPOSED SUCCESSION PLAN DUE TO UPCOMING RETIREMENTS ~ (1)
REVIEW AND CONSIDERATION OF NEW JOB DESCRIPTION FOR TREASURER'S
BILLING CLERK (COMBINATION OF TWO EXISTING JOB DESCRIPTIONS,
TREASURER'S ACCOUNT CLERK AND W/S BILLING CLERK)** (Continued)

Motion by Mr. Rosenberg and supported by Mr. Brown to recommend to the Township Board approval of the following: (1) the replacement of the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst at pay grade level 4.5 as a result of a retirement on July 1st and that the Department Head be allowed to hire an individual up to, but not to exceed two (2) weeks prior to the date of retirement and (2) the replacement of the part-time Account Clerk at pay grade level 4 in the Treasurer's Office as a result of a retirement on April 1st.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg
Nays: None
Absent: None
Motion carried

**CONSIDERATION TO FILL FULL-TIME CODE ENFORCEMENT OFFICER POSITION
FROM WITHIN DUE TO UPCOMING RETIREMENT, INCLUDING PROPOSED
CHANGE TO CERTIFICATION REQUIREMENT ON JOB DESCRIPTION WITH
ADDITIONAL DISCUSSION REGARDING PART-TIME PLAN REVIEWER
POSITION(S)**

This item was removed from the agenda.

**CONSIDERATION TO FILL FULL-TIME SENIOR CLERK TYPIST IN CLERK'S
DEPARTMENT FROM WITHIN DUE TO EMPLOYEE ACCEPTING POSITION IN
TREASURER'S DEPARTMENT**

Mr. Brown stated that in the event Ms. Shaughnessy was not able to have someone fully trained prior to the election, she be allowed to work with Ms. Weingarden to have Carol Secord help out during that time frame. Ms. Shaughnessy stated that her intent was to have someone fully trained immediately.

Mr. Kaplan stated that he did not want to see Ms. Secord divided between departments. Mr. Brown stated that it would only be for a short period of time.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated that Ms. Secord would be starting in the Treasurer's Department on Monday and the position needed to be posted immediately. She stated that she would not have someone in the position until mid March.

CONSIDERATION TO FILL FULL-TIME SENIOR CLERK TYPIST IN CLERK'S DEPARTMENT FROM WITHIN DUE TO EMPLOYEE ACCEPTING POSITION IN TREASURER'S DEPARTMENT (Continued)

Ms. Shaughnessy stated she did not know whether the Committee would allow her to fill the vacancy and reminded the Committee that she gave up the Elections Specialist position at pay grade level 6 last year. Mr. Kaplan stated this was not a major issue and he supported the position being posted.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated that the positions within her department will continually be changing from now until June and asked that she be able to move quickly in order to have individuals in place prior to the election.

Ms. Maier asked that if a part-time employee and an employee at pay grade level 4.0 could be considered for the position. Mr. Rosenberg stated the position was open to anyone in house.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated the individual currently in the position is at pay grade level 4.5 and that change was only made applicable to that individual. She stated that the job itself is a pay grade level 4.

Mr. Kaplan expressed concern as to whether there were implications and if the union would take umbrage at the reduction of the position. Ms. Maier stated there would not be any implications if the position is actually at pay grade level 4.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated her options were going to be limited with respect to hiring individuals in house. She stated the union contract allows any employee currently working within the Township to apply for any opening.

Mr. Brown stated the employee has to be in the union. Ms. Duncan stated that was correct. Mr. Brown asked if all the part-time employees were in the union. Ms. Maier replied, "No."

Mr. Brown stated that technically, Ms. Shaughnessy could be hiring from outside the union for the position. Mr. Kaplan expressed concern with union implications. Ms. Shaughnessy stated the union contract allows for anyone to apply and indicated that Julie Law was part-time and not a union employee; however, she was allowed to apply for the Water & Sewer Clerk position.

Ms. Weingarden stated that when her Senior Account Clerk position was posted she was only allowed to interview employees at pay grade level 4.5. She had a part-time employee apply for the position, but she was not allowed to consider that individual. She stated that if no one applied for the position, she would have asked to

transfer an employee from another department into her department. She stated there was no difference with the Senior Clerk Typist position in the Clerk's Office.

CONSIDERATION TO FILL FULL-TIME SENIOR CLERK TYPIST IN CLERK'S DEPARTMENT FROM WITHIN DUE TO EMPLOYEE ACCEPTING POSITION IN TREASURER'S DEPARTMENT (Continued)

Mr. Brown asked if Ms. Weingarden was satisfied with the individual whom she hired for the Senior Account Clerk position. Ms. Weingarden stated it was not that she was dissatisfied, but she would have wanted the opportunity to interview the other applicant.

Mr. Kaplan stated that if the Committee excluded a part-time employee from applying, it could result in a grievance.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated that it was not even known whether a part-time employee would be applying for the Senior Clerk Typist position. She stated that the Treasurer's Office had an opening for a long period of time which the Board refused to fill. The circumstances were completely different because at the time the request was granted to fill the position, there were issues relative to not increasing the costs. Therefore, she believed the decision was based on several issues such as the amount spent on training and the deputy position within the Treasurer's Office.

Ms. Maier provided the definition of employee as reflect in the union contract: *"Unless otherwise indicated, the term employee when used in this agreement will refer to all employees in the unit of bargaining as defined in Section 2.1."*

Mr. Kaplan stated that the posting would apply to all union employees.

Motion by Mr. Kaplan and supported by Mr. Rosenberg to allow the Township Clerk to begin posting the Senior Clerk Typist position at pay grade level 4, effective 02/23/10 contingent upon Township Board approval on 03/01/10.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg
Nays: None
Absent: None
Motion carried

AUDIENCE GENERAL COMMENTS/QUESTIONS

None.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Marya Duncan

Marya Duncan
HR Specialist

NOTE: Approved minutes of this meeting are maintained as part of the public record and are available upon request. A fee will be required for copies of all meeting tapes and and/or approved minutes. Please contact the Human Resources Department for information.