

**PROCEEDINGS OF PERSONNEL COMMITTEE
WEST BLOOMFIELD TOWN HALL
4550 WALNUT LAKE ROAD
CONFERENCE ROOM 75/76
FRIDAY, JULY 9, 2010 – 12:15 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 12:30 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Members present: Trustee Larry Brown
Trustee Steve Kaplan
Trustee Howard Rosenberg

Members absent: None

Staff Present: Denise Maier, Human Resources Director
Marya Duncan, Human Resources Specialist

General Public: Teri Weingarden, Township Treasurer
Ed Haapala, Water & Sewer Director
Teresa Hebert, IT Department
Teresa Jablonski, Treasurer's Office
Steve Brideau, Budget Director
Millie Gray, Development Services

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion by Mr. Kaplan and supported by Mr. Rosenberg to approve the agenda as presented.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion carried

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Mr. Kaplan and supported by Mr. Brown to approve the minutes of 04/14/10 and 05/05/10 as submitted.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion carried

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

NEW BUSINESS

DISCUSSION REGARDING PROPOSED REORGANIZATION AND CONSIDERATION TO FILL VACANCY IN TREASURER'S DEPARTMENT DUE TO OFFICE COORDINATOR RETIREMENT

Ms. Weingarden stated the Cash Management Assistant has been handling a lot of additional technical responsibilities. Some of those responsibilities have been due to changes in some of the accounting practices. The accounting methods for the Township and Ameriprise differ and the auditors indicated that GASB requires communities to go from accrual base accounting to mark to market analysis in order to reconcile all accounts held with Ameriprise.

Ms. Weingarden stated the employee currently in the Office Coordinator position is retiring on July 31st and the Cash Management Assistant had indicated a willingness to handle some of the Office Coordinator duties. She felt that since the Cash Management Assistant will be handling the additional technical duties as well as some of the Office Coordinator's duties, a half pay grade level increase would be appropriate.

Ms. Weingarden stated that majority of the Office Coordinator positions in Town Hall are at pay grade level 5; however, the Office Coordinator position in the Treasurer's Office is at pay grade level 4.5.

Ms. Weingarden was asking that the Office Coordinator position be reduced from pay grade level 4.5 to 4. She indicated that it would result in a new title and job description of Account Clerk. In addition, she proposed that the Cash Management Assistant position be increased from pay grade level 6 to 6.5. The net difference would be approximately \$2,414.

Ms. Weingarden stated that if an employee were reassigned to fill the Account Clerk position at pay grade level 4, she would rely on the Personnel Director to select that candidate. She felt there was a possibility that if a lateral transfer were to occur, a position would not be backfilled, which would result in a savings to the Township. However, it was dependent upon what department that individual would be transferred from.

Mr. Kaplan asked if the net increase amount resulted from elevating the Cash Management Assistant position a half level and reducing the Office Coordinator position a half level. Ms. Weingarden stated that would be the case if both positions remained at pay grade level G. However, if a lateral move and no reassignment were to occur, the net increase would be \$2,214.

Mr. Kaplan asked if in the event of an absence, would the Cash Management Assistant would be serving in the capacity of the Deputy Treasurer. Ms. Weingarden replied, "Yes" and indicated that the Cash Management Assistant currently serves as back-up for both the Treasurer and Deputy Treasurer.

Mr. Kaplan asked whether there would be another title other than Cash Manager that would be more indicative of the responsibilities to be performed. Ms. Weingarden stated she would be satisfied with any management title. Mr. Kaplan stated it was a fairly high level position and a more austere title would be appropriate.

Mr. Rosenberg stated the request appeared to include an increase from pay grade level 6 to 6.5 for the Cash Management Assistant position with additional duties and no change to the Deputy Treasurer position at pay grade level 7 with additional responsibilities. In addition, a reduction from pay grade level 4.5 to 4.0 for the Office Coordinator with a title change to Treasurer's Cashier.

Mr. Rosenberg asked if a job description was available for the Township Treasurer position. Ms. Maier stated no job descriptions existed for any of the elected positions.

Mr. Rosenberg expressed his opposition to any pay grade level increases for any reason due to the current economic situation. Ultimately, the township will be doing more with less people. It did not matter whether the net increase was \$2,000 or \$10,000.

Mr. Rosenberg stated the Township Treasurer is paid \$104,000 a year and he wanted a job description for that position similar to what is provided for the employees. He felt that many of the tasks listed in the document provided by the Treasurer should be performed by the Treasurer working hard for the residents of the community.

Mr. Rosenberg was agreeable to replacing the Office Coordinator position at pay grade level 4.5; however, he was not in favor of backfilling a position because that last backfill

that occurred resulted in a negative impact and a domino effect. Therefore, he could not support the request as presented.

Ms. Weingarden stated a year ago prior to filling the Deputy Treasurer position, she discussed leveling out the Cash Management Assistant and Deputy Treasurer positions because she felt that both positions performed an equal level of tasks.

Ms. Weingarden stated she was a different Treasurer in comparison to the former Treasurer and felt she worked hard. She stated the only requirement for holding the Township Treasurer position is to be elected by majority of the residents. Although she has a college degree and has learned a lot, she did not have the finance background that the Cash Management Assistant possesses. Therefore, she relies on that individual for accomplishing many tasks.

Mr. Rosenberg stated that being the case, she should not have run for the elected position of Township Treasurer. Ms. Weingarden stated accounting is not a part of the Treasurer's Office; those tasks should actually be handled by the Finance and Accounting Departments. However, because the former Township Treasurer possessed a financial background those tasks were traditionally handled in the Treasurer's Office.

Mr. Rosenberg reiterated that the Township Treasurer was paid \$104,000 a year and therefore, she should be handling a lot of the responsibilities currently being performed by both the Deputy Treasurer and the Cash Management Assistant. His position was that unless Ms. Weingarden was willing to donate some of her salary to cover the performance of those duties, he was not in favor of the request.

Ms. Weingarden expressed a willingness to donate \$2,214 of her salary to accomplish what she proposed. Mr. Rosenberg stated she would have to donate more than that to cover other items.

Mr. Rosenberg stated he could not vote in favor of the request as currently proposed and suggested that a job description for the Township Treasurer be created similar to what has been created for the employees. If it is determined that the Township Treasurer is not able to perform all of the duties listed in the job description, then a portion of the salary should be donated to whatever extent is necessary.

Mr. Rosenberg stated it appeared every request that has appeared before the Committee involved a reorganization of a department and it was exhausting. The last reorganization was not successful and resulted in an employee leaving the Township.

Ms. Weingarden stated the departments who requested those reorganizations were allowed to proceed and it was frustrating that she was not able to do the same.

Mr. Rosenberg stated that if Ms. Weingarden wanted to perform the Township Treasurer's duties on a part-time basis, he suggested that she donate half or two-thirds of her salary back to the Township. Ms. Weingarden stated that the duties she currently performs reflects a full-time rather than a part-time position.

Mr. Kaplan stated the constitution creates the municipality of townships and the statutes create the duties of the Treasurer. It is not for this Committee, any Trustee or the Township Board to add or change what the State requires. If Mr. Rosenberg felt that was a good idea, he should legislatively seek that through the Township's State legislator. He added that the Township Treasurer's duties are statutorily defined and cannot be changed.

Mr. Brown stated that previously, Ms. Weingarden appeared before the Committee requesting an additional position to alleviate some of the duties being performed by the employees within her department. The request was granted; however, it appears that has not made any difference with respect to reduction in the work load even with the additional employee.

Ms. Weingarden stated her office did not have an additional employee. Mr. Brown stated his understanding was that approval was given to add an employee to the Treasurer's complement. Ms. Weingarden stated that was incorrect and indicated that the previous request was simply to fill a position that already existed in her complement.

Mr. Brown expressed concern with the statement made earlier that the elected position of Treasurer was not required to be present full time. He felt that the elected positions were not the typical 40-hour week and that elected officials should do what is expected especially with the salaries being paid for the positions. He stated the Trustees are not paid an exorbitant amount and put in a lot of time attending numerous meetings.

Ms. Weingarden stated she worked in excess of 40 hours a week staying late or coming in on the weekends. She was qualified in many ways, but just did not have the financial background that the Cash Management Assistant has. She did not have some of the skill sets which her staff possesses and therefore, she delegates those duties to be performed by the appropriate employee.

Mr. Brown stated it was his understanding that the Cash Management Assistant is currently overburdened and can barely keep up with the amount of work. He asked if the request would result in additional responsibilities. Ms. Weingarden stated those additional responsibilities were being allocated to other employees.

Mr. Brown stated that in the past, Ms. Weingarden has proposed that an outside source handle the cash management duties. Therefore, he was confused with the request. He

was not ready to make a decision on whether to spend additional monies to outsource the cash management function.

Ms. Weingarden stated the goal of outsourcing is to make money. If the Township Board decides not to change the investment policy, she would not pursue that because the Township would simply be paying for reporting duties.

Ms. Jablonski stated although she understood the Committee's opposition to increasing salaries, the fact remains that increases have occurred in other departments in the last two years for individuals who have taken on more responsibilities.

Ms. Jablonski stated that there were several positions in which the pay grade levels were scheduled to be reduced at the time a position was vacated. However, the Township Board recently approved to maintain those pay grade levels which eliminated potential cost savings.

Ms. Jablonski stated although she is more qualified to perform many of the duties listed in the documentation provided, Ms. Weingarden ultimately approves the work and takes responsibility for the work being performed.

Ms. Jablonski stated that with respect to the outsourcing issue, her understanding is that the company would be handling the investment services and providing reporting on those investments. A lot of the duties related to cash management which she performs has more to do with internal reporting. The outsourced company would not handle that type of reporting and therefore, it would not reduce her workload.

Ms. Jablonski stated that with respect to taking over some of the Office Coordinator's duties, the intent was for her to work more closely with the Treasurer and Deputy Treasurer to reorganize the front office duties and implement cross training.

Ms. Hebert expressed concern and indicated that the union would have an issue with an employee from another department being reassigned because the last reassignment has not yet been resolved. In addition, it did not produce any positive results.

Ms. Hebert stated that Ms. Jablonski has taken on more technical duties and regardless of anyone's opinion regarding what the Treasurer should be responsible for, the fact remains that Ms. Jablonski has been performing the work. When the same situation occurred in the Clerk's Office, the Township Clerk was given carte blanche to increase pay grade levels for certain positions.

Ms. Hebert stated the duties have been performed by Ms. Jablonski for the past 18 months. The union has made every attempt to work with Ms. Weingarden to prevent the filing of a grievance. She stated that Ms. Jablonski performs the work very well and wants to do the work. In addition, it benefits the Township to have someone with the financial background that Ms. Jablonski possesses to perform those duties.

Ms. Hebert expressed concern that some members of the Committee were opposed to increasing a salary to compensate the additional work being performed very well when

there have been instances in which a potential cost savings has been used towards a salary increase in other departments.

Mr. Rosenberg stated he could not support the request as proposed and regardless of what the constitution indicates, as a taxpayer, he expects the Treasurer to work. Therefore, he felt that the Treasurer needed to step up and take on those additional responsibilities. He was not denying the level of work performed by Ms. Jablonski or her expertise, but he would not vote in favor of increasing salaries. However, he would vote in favor of filling the Office Coordinator position

Mr. Brown disagreed with Mr. Rosenberg that the Treasurer was not working. Rather, he believed she was handling certain responsibilities, but not all the duties which were performed in the past by former Township Treasurer. Those duties were delegated to other staff members.

Mr. Brown stated Ms. Weingarden made a statement that she was willing to give up a portion of her salary to have the duties performed by an employee. Mr. Rosenberg stated that a pay grade level increase ultimately impacts the pension and health care costs. Therefore, he could not agree with the proposal.

Mr. Kaplan expressed concern with an elected official taking a reduction in salary. He stated that salary has already been established and therefore, he was opposed to the idea of Ms. Weingarden giving up a portion of her salary when she would be taxed on it anyway. In addition, it was bad public policy.

Mr. Rosenberg stated he was not agreeable to Ms. Weingarden giving up a portion of her salary; he simply felt that she needed to step up and take on the responsibilities.

Mr. Brown asked that if the Committee denied the request, would Ms. Jablonski continue to perform the additional duties.

Mr. Kaplan stated it was not the Committee's decision to approve or deny the request, but rather, the Township Board's decision to make. Mr. Brown understood that and was simply questioning what would occur in the event the Committee did not make a recommendation of approval.

Ms. Weingarden stated that in her defense, the duties which the former Township Treasurer performed are not typically done by most Township Treasurers and that majority of the treasurers are simply figure heads.

Ms. Weingarden stated she was simply attempting to compensate Ms. Jablonski for the additional work that she performs and quite well. Mr. Brown stated although he understood her intent, he had concerns with approving an increase for one employee when the unions have taken cuts in pay.

Motion by Mr. Rosenberg and supported by Mr. Brown to recommend to the Township Board approval to fill the Office Coordinator position upon retirement of the current employee.

Mr. Kaplan stated he was not in favor of a partial motion. The request before the Committee includes two issues and therefore, he felt the Committee agreeing on one issue and being silent on the other issue is misleading.

Mr. Kaplan stated the Township has an elected Treasurer who knows more about her department than any of the Committee members because she is on staff full-time. She has asked that one position be upgraded to pay grade level 6.5 and another position downgraded to pay grade level 4.0. He trusts what Ms. Weingarden has stated and was aware of how hard Ms. Jablonski works. Therefore, he was in favor of the reorganization even though he was the minority on this issue.

Motion by Mr. Rosenberg and supported by Mr. Brown to recommend to the Township Board approval to fill the Office Coordinator position upon retirement of the current employee and denial of the remainder of the request.

Ayes: Brown, Rosenberg

Nays: Kaplan

Absent: None

Motion carried

Ms. Jablonski questioned how the denial impacted her since she was performing the additional work that was not included in her job description and was not being compensated for it.

Mr. Kaplan stated the Committee was not in a position to give her direction. Mr. Brown stated it was inappropriate for the Committee to provide guidance on that issue. He indicated that she has the option of speaking with a union steward as well as the Township Treasurer regarding that issue.

DISCUSSION AND CONSIDERATION REGARDING TRANSITION PLAN FOR TWO (2) UPCOMING VACANCIES IN THE WATER & SEWER DEPARTMENT DUE TO ONE (1) WATER & SEWER BILLING ANALYST RETIRING AND ONE (1) WATER & SEWER ANALYST ACCEPTING ACCOUNTS PAYABLE POSITION IN THE FINANCE DEPARTMENT

Mr. Haapala stated that he has two Water & Sewer Billing Analysts. One of them will be retiring on July 30th and that position has been replaced. However, the training has only occurred for a period of two weeks. The other Water & Sewer Billing Analyst has accepted the Accounts Payable position in the Finance Department in the Clerk's Office.

Mr. Haapala stated he has been informed that this individual will begin the Accounts Payable position on July 19th. This individual is on vacation all next week and therefore, will be packing up this week in preparation for the move into the new position.

Mr. Brown stated it appears there will be no training conducted due to the individual not being present next week. Mr. Haapala stated that was correct.

Mr. Haapala stated he spoke with Ms. Shaughnessy who understood the situation and indicated she would work with him on the issue. He stated that if it were possible to keep one Water & Sewer Billing Analyst in the department until the end of the month that would allow for training of the individual who will fill that position.

Mr. Haapala asked for the following: (1) that the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst transferring to the Finance Department be allowed to remain in the Water & Sewer Department until the end of July and (2) that the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst scheduled to retire on July 30th be allowed to come back on a part-time basis through the end of the year to provide for training and assistance in the technical aspects of the BS&A system as well as the water and sewer operational maintenance.

Mr. Haapala stated the deadline for application submittal for the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst position is 07/12/10. His understanding is that there are three or four individuals who have applied for the position.

Mr. Brown asked if the part-time position would have benefits. Ms. Duncan replied, "No" and indicated that an employee has to work 20 hours per week to receive any benefits.

Mr. Rosenberg stated the Committee did not have to address the issue regarding the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst that is transferring to the Clerk's Office because that situation could be resolved between Mr. Haapala and Ms. Shaughnessy.

Motion by Mr. Kaplan and supported by Mr. Brown to recommend to the Township Board approval to hire Barb Kula two (2) days a week at the same rate of pay not to exceed 16 hours per week to provide training for the Water & Sewer Billing Analyst position until December 31, 2010 and that this item be placed on the Consent Agenda.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion carried

Mr. Haapala stated the Water & Sewer Billing Department should not be located in Town Hall. The Township should only accept checks, money orders, or credit cards and that the billing be performed at the Water & Sewer Facility on Haggerty Road.

Mr. Brown stated he did not have a problem with that. Mr. Haapala stated the department could be easily bonded to accept checks, money orders, credit cards or accept payments made on the internet.

Mr. Kaplan asked if it would be inconvenient for residents to pay their water bills at the Water & Sewer Facility. Mr. Haapala did not believe it would because he felt individuals came to Town Hall for different reasons.

Mr. Haapala expressed concern that there has been a disconnection between the Water & Sewer Billing and the Water & Sewer Operations due to the separate locations. Mr. Rosenberg suggested that he bring the issue before the Township Board.

AUDIENCE GENERAL COMMENTS/QUESTIONS

None.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Marya Duncan

Marya Duncan
HR Specialist

NOTE: Approved minutes of this meeting are maintained as part of the public record and are available upon request. A fee will be required for copies of all meeting tapes and and/or approved minutes. Please contact the Human Resources Department for information.