

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE
PERSONNEL COMMITTEE
CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF WEST BLOOMFIELD
CONFERENCE ROOM 75/76
4550 WALNUT LAKE ROAD
TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 23, 2010 --- 12:30 P.M.**

Members present: Lawrence Brown, Steve Kaplan, Howard Rosenberg

Members absent: None

Staff present: Denise Maier, HR Director
Marya Duncan, HR Specialist

Others present: None

General public: Chief Mike Patton, Police Department
Marshall Labadie, Development Services Director
Millie Gray, Development Services

CALL TO ORDER Chairman Brown called the meeting to order at 12:32 p.m.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA The Agenda was approved as amended.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Rosenberg and supported by Brown to approve the minutes of 10/06/10 and 10/26/10 as presented.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion carried

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

CONSIDERATION TO CONVERT THE PREVIOUSLY APPROVED PART-TIME SENIOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES CLERK TO FULL-TIME

Marshall Labadie, Development Services Director, stated that on 10/06/10 he came before the Committee requesting to fill a part-time position. Since that time, he has lost two (2) full-time Senior Development Clerks and is down 2.5 clerical positions. The minimum staff level for his department is 5.5 positions. He stated the Senior Development Clerks provide administrative duties to Building and Planning in addition to Engineering and Environmental.

Mr. Rosenberg asked for the number of clerks. Mr. Labadie replied, "Three." Mr. Labadie stated that two (2) clerks handle the counter and one (1) is permanently assigned to the Community Development Department handling special assignments and support for the Community Development Director, Senior Planner, and Building Inspection Supervisor.

Mr. Rosenberg stated the special assignment could end and that Senior Development Clerk could return to the Development Services Department. Mr. Labadie questioned how the duties handled by that individual would be fulfilled if that were to happen. Mr. Rosenberg stated that issue would have to be addressed by the Community Development Department.

Mr. Rosenberg stated the Development Services Department has three (3) full-time people and one (1) part-time opening. Mr. Labadie replied, "Yes, and the department is losing a total of two people." Mr. Rosenberg stated the department is down 1.5 people. Mr. Labadie stated the department is actually down 2.5 people.

Mr. Rosenberg asked what currently exists and what has been approved. He added it appears that three (3) full-time people exist. Mr. Labadie stated that 2.5 positions are vacant as a result of transfers to other departments.

Mr. Brown stated the department had 5.5 people prior to the transfers and there will be 3.5 people after the 2 full-time people leave the department. Mr. Labadie stated he was requesting two (2) people and added that the department was down one (1) recording secretary.

Mr. Rosenberg stated there were three (3) full-time positions. Mr. Labadie stated that prior to staff members leaving for promotional opportunities, the department has five (5) people which include one (1) person on special assignment with the Community Development Department.

CONSIDERATION TO CONVERT THE PREVIOUSLY APPROVED PART-TIME SENIOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES CLERK TO FULL-TIME (Continued)

Mr. Rosenberg stated that will leave the department with 3.5 people after the two (2) full-time people leave. Mr. Labadie stated that was correct.

Mr. Rosenberg stated he was not concerned with minimum service levels and did not believe that all the services were a core functionality of the township. He added that there has been a 30 to 40 percent drop in revenue and therefore, the township must drop non-essential services. He asked how the department would function with 3.5 people and whether any services could be outsourced.

Mr. Labadie stated it was not possible to outsource the clerical services; however, it would be possible to outsource the transcription of minutes.

Mr. Labadie stated that although the services may be considered non-essential, the operations within the department are mandated by ordinance and state law. He stated it would impact the wetland, woodland, and building permits.

Mr. Rosenberg stated those permits are down in numbers. Mr. Labadie stated that was incorrect; there has been an increase in permits this year. Mr. Kaplan asked what attributed to that increase. Mr. Labadie stated that people are staying put and performing maintenance on existing homes. Mr. Kaplan asked if that was based on imperative data or forecast. Mr. Labadie stated it was based on the number of permits. Currently, there are 57 permits and at the end of the quarter it will be at 60 permits, which has not happened since 2003.

Mr. Brown stated that in 2005 there were 2,285 permits; 2,204 in 2007; and approximately 2,300 permits this year. Mr. Labadie stated that oddly enough, the department is getting busy and the vacant property as well as rental property programs has to be considered. Clerical support will be required to maintain those programs. In addition, clerical support is needed for unfunded mandates such as storm water management.

Mr. Brown asked that if two individuals are hired, would it add to the staffing levels. Ms. Maier replied, "No." Mr. Rosenberg stated the Township is \$23 million in the hole and therefore, cannot afford to hire people. Mr. Labadie questioned whether the Township Board would be prepared for the backlash if services were not provided.

Mr. Brown asked if outsourcing the transcription of minutes would free up individuals to perform other services. Mr. Labadie replied, "No" and indicated that the Office Manager currently transcribes minutes; however, there could be issues with the union if that were to be done on a consistent basis.

CONSIDERATION TO CONVERT THE PREVIOUSLY APPROVED PART-TIME SENIOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES CLERK TO FULL-TIME (Continued)

Mr. Kaplan stated at one time there was discussion relative to combining the Wetland and Woodland Boards. He asked what savings would be generated if that were to occur. Mr. Labadie stated it would be a minimal savings of approximately \$10,000 to \$15,000. He added that combining those boards was not well received by the board members. Mr. Rosenberg stated it did not go well with the board members; however, the public did not have a problem with it. Mr. Kaplan stated it would save money on the per diem and utilities.

Mr. Rosenberg asked that if the Committee were to recommend approval of one (1) position, would he be able to work with that. Mr. Labadie stated that it would be difficult to do because there is a large volume of calls and counter traffic. The BS&A permit system has helped achieve minimum staffing levels to an extent; however, it would be difficult to provide the current level of services with a wholesale change of operations.

Mr. Brown asked if restructuring the department and having different job descriptions could result in savings as well as efficiency. Mr. Labadie replied, "Yes" and stated clerical support is necessary because the community requires access and time. Therefore, there is still a service demand by the customer.

Mr. Rosenberg stated he was willing to approve converting the part-time Senior Development Clerk position to full-time and that the department head should come back to the Committee with a redeveloped plan on whether the department can continue working at that staffing level. Mr. Brown stated the department would still be short 1.5 people.

Mr. Labadie stated the department requires 5.5 people because four (4) people are required at the front counter. There is plenty of work for that number of people. The department would still be down one (1) position if the Committee only approved converting the part-time to full-time position.

Mr. Kaplan stated this department head is not one who constantly seeks additional staff and as long as there are mandates, he was in favor of approving five (5) positions. Mr. Brown agreed and commented about the concerns from residents regarding the efficiencies of the department as well as adequate staff to provide for the efficiency. He still wanted to see whether the department could be restructured with outsourcing of the minutes.

Mr. Brown asked if it were possible to operate the department with four (4) people. Ms. Gray replied that four (4) people were required up front. She added that the department has been busier this year and that absences due to sick time or vacation should also be considered.

CONSIDERATION TO CONVERT THE PREVIOUSLY APPROVED PART-TIME SENIOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES CLERK TO FULL-TIME (Continued)

Mr. Rosenberg stated that although he agreed with all the comments made, the Township does not have the money to provide the staffing level requested.

Mr. Labadie stated things will not get done without the minimum staff level. Mr. Brown stated that the budget currently reflects five (5) Senior Development Clerks.

Motion by Kaplan and supported by Brown to recommend to the Township Board approval to convert the previously approved part-time Senior Development Services Clerk to full-time and a staffing level of five (5) full-time Development Services Clerks.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan

Nays: Rosenberg

Absent: None

Motion carried

CONSIDERATION TO POST A SECOND FULL-TIME SENIOR DEVELOPMENT SERVICES CLERK POSITION INTERNALLY AND IF NO ONE APPLIES, TO HIRE FROM OUTSIDE

This item was discussed in conjunction with the previous item.

Motion by Kaplan and supported by Brown to recommend to the Township Board approval to post a second full-time Senior Development Services Clerk position internally and if no one applies, to hire from outside.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion carried

CONSIDERATION TO CONVERT PART-TIME MAINTENANCE POSITION TO FULL-TIME WITH CHANGE TO JOB DESCRIPTION TO INCLUDE CLEANING RESPONSIBILITIES FOR TOWN HALL

Mr. Rosenberg asked why this was being requested. Mr. Labadie stated it would result in money savings, vested interest in upkeep of the building, and an opportunity to have an individual perform all the cleaning in house.

CONSIDERATION TO CONVERT PART-TIME MAINTENANCE POSITION TO FULL-TIME WITH CHANGE TO JOB DESCRIPTION TO INCLUDE CLEANING RESPONSIBILITIES FOR TOWN HALL (Continued)

Mr. Rosenberg asked why not obtain another contractor if not satisfied with the existing contractor. Mr. Labadie stated it would be more costly to do so at an additional \$5,000 to \$6,000 a year.

Mr. Rosenberg asked for the cost of current services. Mr. Labadie replied, "\$53,000 for five days at Town Hall and one day at the Water & Sewer Facility." Ms. Maier stated there is an additional cost for services such as waxing the floors.

Mr. Brown commented that \$27 per hour for the cleaning services was a lot. Mr. Labadie stated the Township has not bid out the services since 2007 and it could possibly obtain a cheaper cost.

Mr. Kaplan questioned whether the Township could deal directly with an independent contractor. Mr. Labadie stated it was a possibility. Mr. Brown stated that small businesses were much cheaper. Mr. Labadie stated that most of the small businesses cost \$20 per hour. Mr. Brown stated it would save approximately \$1,000 a month at that rate. Mr. Labadie stated it was important to have someone who cared about the building as well as about the work they perform.

Mr. Rosenberg agreed that qualifications should be pride and workmanship which can be obtained through references. He was not in agreement to converting the position to full-time until he reviewed bids from other companies. Mr. Kaplan suggested that it would be possible to find an individual who has retired from the school district.

Motion by Kaplan and supported by Rosenberg to table converting the part-time maintenance position to full-time with change to job description to include cleaning responsibilities for town hall.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion carried

CONSIDERATION TO ALLOW FOR THE UNFREEZING OF POLICE DEPARTMENT TESTING FUNDS TO ALLOW FOR SERGEANT TESTING

Mr. Brown stated the department used to have 12 sergeants and there is a request to have 11 sergeants.

CONSIDERATION TO ALLOW FOR THE UNFREEZING OF POLICE DEPARTMENT TESTING FUNDS TO ALLOW FOR SERGEANT TESTING (Continued)

Chief Patton stated that a decade ago, the department was staffed with 1 Police Chief, 1 Deputy Police Chief, 5 lieutenants, and 12 sergeants. As a result of the reductions and changes in the last year, the department is down to 15 command officers. He was not filling the Deputy Police Chief position. There were 12 sergeants and he was currently looking at 8 sergeants in the Patrol Division for a minimum operational level.

Chief Patton stated that if the department were to operate with 2 sergeants per shift, it would result in police officers working numerous days without any relief. He was considering transferring 1 sergeant out of the Investigations Bureau into the Patrol Division and activating a seldom used provision in the contract to have a sergeant act as the relief person with a lieutenant acting as the day shift supervisor.

Mr. Kaplan commented that having a sergeant working three different shifts in a week would take a toll on an individual's health. Chief Patton agreed.

Mr. Kaplan asked if the individual being transferred out of the Investigations Bureau was in favor of the change. Chief Patton replied, "Yes."

Chief Patton stated the testing would be a six month process and was optimistic that a new sergeant could be promoted by May 1st.

Mr. Rosenberg questioned whether another canine officer was needed and commented that the retiring canine officer provides an opportunity to consider sharing services with other canine units.

Mr. Rosenberg asked about the role of the administrative sergeant. Chief Patton stated that individual was an extension of the Police Chief's office who oversees technical services, cadets, dispatchers, cleaning staff and maintenance garage staff.

Mr. Rosenberg stated it does not appear that a sworn officer is required to oversee those areas and suggested that an office manager could handle those duties.

Chief Patton agreed that some of the duties could be performed by civilians and has already looked into that because he wanted the police officers to enforce the laws.

Mr. Rosenberg asked if the department transitioned from an administrative sergeant to a civilian office manager, the administrative sergeant could be placed on duty and it would not be necessary to have a sergeant promotion.

CONSIDERATION TO ALLOW FOR THE UNFREEZING OF POLICE DEPARTMENT TESTING FUNDS TO ALLOW FOR SERGEANT TESTING (Continued)

Chief Patton stated the department was in need of a sergeant now. Mr. Brown stated that the department would still need an administrative sergeant even if it was found that a sergeant could be replaced with an office manager. Mr. Rosenberg stated the administrative sergeant could be placed in the Patrol Division or the Investigations Bureau which would still result in 10 sergeants and an office manger could be hired.

Motion by Kaplan and supported by Brown to recommend to the Township Board approval to allow for the unfreezing of Police Department testing funds to allow for Sergeant testing.

Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg

Nays: None

Absent: None

Motion carried

* * * * *

Mr. Rosenberg expressed concern with the current hiring policy. He was willing to reopen that issue for discussion and commented that he could not find the hiring policy on the township website.

Mr. Rosenberg stated his understanding of the process was that the Police Chief chose from the top 8 candidates and felt it should be from the top three (3) candidates. Mr. Kaplan stated that under Chief Cronin, an individual was chosen from the top eight (8) candidates. Chief Patton stated the process includes selection from the top three (3) candidates and allows for discretion by the Police Chief.

Mr. Rosenberg stated the Human Resources Director selected the three (3) individuals for the Oral Board. Chief Patton stated who those people are is defined in the contract

CONSIDERATION TO ACCEPT PROPOSED CHANGES TO THE EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT JOB DESCRIPTION (CHANGES TO BE IMPLEMENTED ONLY AFTER CURRENT EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT RETIRES)

Mr. Brown asked if he has reviewed the modifications to the job description. Chief Patton replied, "Yes."

CONSIDERATION TO ACCEPT PROPOSED CHANGES TO THE EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT JOB DESCRIPTION (CHANGES TO BE IMPLEMENTED ONLY AFTER CURRENT EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT RETIRES) (Continued)

Motion by Rosenberg and supported by Kaplan to recommend to the Township Board approval to accept proposed changes to the Executive Assistant job description (changes to be implemented only after current Executive Assistant retires).

**Ayes: Brown, Kaplan, Rosenberg
Nays: None
Absent: None
Motion carried**

AUDIENCE GENERAL COMMENTS/QUESTIONS

None

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 1:46 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Marya Duncan
Marya Duncan, HR Specialist