

**PROCEEDINGS OF**  
**PERSONNEL COMMITTEE MEETING**  
**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF WEST BLOOMFIELD**  
**4550 WALNUT LAKE ROAD**  
**CONFERENCE ROOM 76**  
  
**THURSDAY, OCTOBER 16, 2008 --- 3:30 P.M.**

**CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order by Trustee Spector at 3:05 p.m.

Members Present:           Trustee Deborah Macon  
                                  Trustee Robert Sher  
                                  Trustee Robert Spector

Members Absent:           None

Staff Present:             Kent Herbert, Human Resources Director

In Attendance:            Cathy Shaughnessy  
                                  David Flaisher, Township Supervisor  
                                  Ed Haapala, Water & Sewer Director  
                                  Mike Stuber, T.E.A.M.

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

**Motion by Mr. Sher and supported by Ms. Macon to approve the agenda as submitted.**

**Ayes: Macon, Sher, Spector**  
**Nays: None**  
**Absent: None**  
**Motion carried**

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion by Ms. Macon and supported by Mr. Sher to approve the minutes of 07/07/08 as submitted.**

**Ayes: Macon, Sher, Spector  
Nays: None  
Absent: None  
Motion carried**

### **SET NEXT MEETING DATE**

None.

### **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

#### **REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS CONCERNING CADET PROGRAM**

Mr. Herbert stated he sent a letter to the Police Chief regarding his recommendations for the cadet program. There were some cadets who did not do very well on the police exam. Although the cadets passed the exam, they did not achieve the required 80% score and therefore, they felt a waiver should have been given. However, a waiver would not be complying with the ordinance.

Mr. Herbert suggested that the Township no longer hire cadets who have not taken the exam or if the exam is taken, the individual must score at least 75%. He also suggested that when the pay plan is modified for non-bargaining individuals, which includes cadets, a program should also be provided to pay matching tuition for the cadets.

Mr. Sher asked if the items suggested would be new policy. Mr. Herbert replied, "Yes" and indicated that he sent the items to the Police Chief on two occasions; however, he has not responded.

Mr. Spector stated the Township Board already approved the criteria of 80% as a minimum score. Mr. Herbert stated that criteria only applied to police officers and not cadets.

Ms. Macon asked for clarification of the change to the existing criteria. Mr. Herbert stated that the prospective cadets would be required to score 75% on the police officer exam.

**REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS CONCERNING CADET PROGRAM** (Continued)

Mr. Spector asked if an individual can become a police officer without first being a cadet. Mr. Herbert replied, "Yes" and indicated that an individual simply has to pass the exam. Mr. Spector asked if law enforcement education was required. Mr. Herbert replied, "No, not at this time." He added that the Township Police Department was one of the departments that do not require a law enforcement degree.

Mr. Sher asked what the Committee needed to do. Mr. Herbert stated that he was asking for a recommendation from the Committee to place an amendment to the ordinance requiring an individual to obtain a minimum score of 75% on the police exam prior to be hired as a cadet and that he be directed to provide a 50% match for any cadet education related to becoming a police officer.

Mr. Sher asked if the education would be mandatory. Mr. Herbert replied, "No" and indicated that he would not propose that it be mandatory. Mr. Sher asked if the criteria included a minimum score in order to be considered for a cadet position. Mr. Herbert stated that currently, no criteria existed at all. Mr. Spector expressed concern with the police officer qualifications and that it did not require law enforcement degree when, in fact, other communities do.

Mr. Herbert stated that a comparable survey could be obtained from other communities with respect to cadet and police officer positions as well as a response from the Police Chief regarding the requirement of a police administration degree. Mr. Spector asked if the process was similar with respect to hiring fire fighters. Mr. Herbert replied, "No" and indicated that specific certifications were required prior to being considered for a fire fighter position.

Mr. Spector supported the cadet program and felt that it provided a savings for the Township since those individuals handled a variety of tasks within the police department.

Mr. Herbert suggested that a cadet should not remain in a program after a period of five years.

Ms. Macon stated that the Police Chief be given an opportunity to review the results obtained from the survey.

Mr. Spector asked what she felt about the limitation for the cadet program. Ms. Macon stated that the Police Chief should be given an opportunity to review the suggestions. Mr. Herbert stated that he has already provided those suggestions to the Police Chief. The only item which has not submitted to the Police Chief is relative to the requirement of a police administration degree and certifications.

**REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS CONCERNING CADET PROGRAM** (Continued)

Mr. Spector commented that the cadet position was a menial job. Mr. Herbert stated that the cadets are only allowed to work up to 32 hours.

Ms. Macon asked if most of the cadets were in school while in the position. Mr. Herbert stated some of them were attending school. Mr. Herbert stated the budget allowed for eight cadets. Ms. Macon asked for the current number of cadets. Mr. Herbert replied, "Eight."

Mr. Sher asked if the Committee preferred to review the criteria from the other communities prior to making a decision. Ms. Macon stated it made more sense to have the items submitted as a package. Mr. Herbert stated that he would present the recommendations to the Board at the 11/17/08 meeting, since the Committee has already reviewed it. Mr. Spector added that a recommendation could be provided at the Board level as well.

Mr. Herbert stated he would not be presenting a pay plan at the 11/17/08, but rather, he was going to wait until the new Board was in place. Ms. Macon suggested that the proposal be placed on the agenda for consideration of introduction.

**NEW BUSINESS**

**JOB DESCRIPTION – OFFICE MANAGER (CLERK’S OFFICE)**

Mr. Herbert stated that this position would be similar to the Office Manager position in the Development Services Department. He stated this request is a change from what presently exists in the Clerk’s Office because there will be a Deputy Clerk as well as an Executive Assistant.

Mr. Sher asked for an organizational chart. Mr. Herbert provided the chart for the Committee’s review and indicated that it has been updated to reflect the changes within the Finance Department.

Mr. Spector noted that there were 11 employees within the Clerk’s Office. Mr. Herbert stated there were 9 employees in the Clerk’s Office and 5 in the Finance Department, which falls under the Clerk.

Ms. Macon asked about the Executive Assistant position. Mr. Herbert stated the Executive Assistant will be eliminated. Ms. Macon asked what positions would be added, if any. Mr. Herbert stated "Office Manager." Ms. Macon asked where the Office Manager position would be placed on the organization chart. Ms. Shaughnessy stated it would be in place of the Executive Assistant and indicated that the complement of the office will not change.

**JOB DESCRIPTION – OFFICE MANAGER (CLERK’S OFFICE)** (Continued)

Mr. Spector asked about the pay grade level. Mr. Herbert stated the position will be at pay grade level 6.

Ms. Macon asked if the Deputy Clerk would report to the Office Manager. Mr. Sher stated that the organizational reflected the Deputy Clerk reporting directly to the Clerk. Ms. Macon stated the Office Manager is a supervisory position and she wanted clarification relative to which positions the Office Manager would serve as supervisor. Ms. Shaughnessy stated the Clerk’s Office staff, which consists of six employees, would report to the Office Manager.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated that currently there is a Deputy Clerk, which is a statutory position and that individual has been serving as the Office Manager. The employee who currently serves in that position is retiring and that particular position has numerous administrative as well as statutory duties. She wanted to have an Office Manager in the department and was not asking for anything additional. She was simply attempting to assign the lost duties of an Office Manager that are leaving with the retiring Deputy Clerk to the Executive Assistant.

Ms. Macon stated every Township Clerk in the State has the authority to hire their own Deputy Clerk and in addition to whatever the statutory duties are for that Deputy Clerk, which are not very extensive. She stated the Deputy Clerk does whatever the Clerk wants that individual to do.

Ms. Macon asked if she was indicating that she no longer wished to have an Executive Assistant in the Clerk’s Office, but rather, an Office Manager. Ms. Shaughnessy stated she wanted to combine the duties to be performed by one individual.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated that she asked the current Executive Assistant who has been in the Clerk’s Office for 19 years, who is totally familiar with every duty in the office, to be her Deputy Clerk. She is currently going through the union and director channels to hire a new Executive Assistant/Office Manager. Therefore, she was basically asking to assign office manager additional duties to the existing position.

Mr. Herbert stated that under the current contract, the existing Executive Assistant position drops one pay grade level when it is vacated by the employee and Ms. Shaughnessy wanted to retain the current pay grade level.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated there is no position within the Clerk’s Office which she is able to assign supervisory duties to at the current time. Mr. Sher asked about the Deputy Clerk position. Ms. Shaughnessy stated the Deputy Clerk will be handling the administrative duties.

**JOB DESCRIPTION – OFFICE MANAGER (CLERK’S OFFICE)** (Continued)

Mr. Spector asked for the difference in the pay grade levels for the position. Mr. Herbert stated that once the position reaches the maximum, which would take approximately two years, it would be \$4,000 in wages and \$1,000 in fringe benefits. Mr. Spector stated that it will cost the residents an additional \$5,000 over what the Board has already determined that the position is overpaid.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated the pay grade level 6 is what the Township pays all the Office Managers. Mr. Spector stated he understood that; however, the Township Board has already determined that the Executive Assistant position is overpaid by \$5,000 and once that position is vacated, the pay grade level be reduced.

Mr. Spector stated that he could not see spending the money and indicated that Ms. Shaughnessy could simply address the issue in less than a month when she takes office.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated that without having worked in the Township, she felt there were other areas that could be changed and possibly, there are one or two positions that could be part-time. However, those changes cannot be made right now and she was simply attempting to start at the beginning and set up a structure for the office which is needed and will work well in the future.

Mr. Sher stated that with the budget deficits, he questioned whether the Clerk’s Office needed all the employees currently allocated to the department. He asked whether the department could do without the Executive Assistant/Office Manager position and have the Deputy Clerk perform the duties of an Office Manager. He stated the Township was dealing with a deficit of \$180,000 this year and \$800,000 deficit next year. Based on those figures, he felt it was necessary to have a hiring freeze and have the Deputy Clerk handle the duties and not replace the Executive Assistant position.

Ms. Shaughnessy stated she could appoint someone from outside as the Deputy Clerk; however, she chose not to do that because it was not the right or fair thing to do.

Mr. Herbert stated there was another vacancy coming up in the Clerk’s Office at the end of the month and consideration should be made relative to making that a part-time position.

Ms. Shaughnessy felt there were some positions in the Clerk’s Office which could be part-time, but was not certain as to which positions. She did not want to leave the office short staffed in the Executive Assistant position because she needed five clerical positions.

**JOB DESCRIPTION – OFFICE MANAGER (CLERK’S OFFICE)** (Continued)

Mr. Sher suggested that the Executive Assistant be hired at pay grade level 5.5 and determine whether that individual wanted to be the Office Manager and go back to the new Township Board with a proposal to free up the Deputy Clerk from performing the Office Manager duties and change the Executive Assistant position to a Office Manager/Executive Assistant and raise the pay grade level from 5.5 to 6.

\* \* \* \* \*

Mr. Spector indicated he had to step out for a short period. In his absence, Ms. Macon served as Chair pro-tem and recognized Supervisor Flaisher. In doing so, she indicated that a quorum of the Township Board at the Personnel Committee does not constitute a decision-making body.

\* \* \* \* \*

Mr. Flaisher commented that at one time there were Office Managers within the Building, Engineering, Environmental, and Planning Departments. The reorganization of those departments resulted in one Office Manager serving all four departments. Therefore, the numbers of Office Manager positions have been reduced within the building. He stated that one employee within the Clerk’s Office will be transferring to another department and the current Executive Assistant will be serving as the Deputy Clerk. He stated that at the upcoming budget meeting he was going to recommend that one of those positions not be filled. He added that all of the surrounding communities have a hiring freeze.

Ms. Macon stated the comments made are not part of the decision-making so as not to violate the rule that four Township Board members constitute a quorum.

\* \* \* \* \*

Mr. Herbert stated that when all the job descriptions were being reviewed, it was discovered that the Senior Clerk Typist job description in the Clerk’s Office was not adopted.

Mr. Herbert stated that with respect to the Senior Recording Secretary job description, the current requirement is two years experience with the Township and the proposal is to remove that requirement.

Mr. Sher asked if there were any financial impacts. Mr. Herbert replied, “No.”

**Motion by Ms. Macon and supported by Mr. Sher to recommend that the Senior Clerk Typist job description be adopted and that the two years experience with the Township be deleted from the Senior Recording Secretary job description.**

**Ayes: Macon, Sher, Spector  
Nays: None  
Absent: None  
Motion carried**

**JOB DESCRIPTION MODIFICATION – OFFICE COORDINATOR (WATER & SEWER DEPARTMENT)**

Ms. Macon asked that this item be deferred in order to allow the Committee to review the wellness program presentation.

**WELLNESS PROGRAM – T.E.A.M.**

Mike Stuber, T.E.A.M. representative, provided a brief history of the company as well as a summary of the program. He indicated that the company offers a comprehensive program which can be offered to the employees for a full complement of services provided on an annual basis.

Mr. Spector asked if the cost to the Township would be \$27,000 annually for 300 participants. Mr. Stuber replied, "Yes." Mr. Spector asked if there were other charges. Mr. Stuber stated there was discussion with Mr. Herbert relative to including spouses to impact the overall wellness of the couple and not just the employee. If the program included over 300 participants, there would be an additional charge per participant; however, the company was willing to cover up to 300 participants.

Ms. Macon stated the proposal does not include the members of the Township Board. She asked that the Trustees as well as members of appointed boards be included. Mr. Spector stated it was a wonderful idea; however, the Township has a deficit as indicated by Mr. Sher earlier.

Mr. Herbert stated these programs impact the claims in that it results in a reduction and basically, it delays the onset of chronic diseases. He asked about the additional charge per participant. Mr. Stuber stated the additional charge would apply to anything over 300 participants. Mr. Sher asked if \$27,000 was the minimum amount. Mr. Stuber replied, "Yes." Mr. Herbert estimated that there would be 50 spouses involved in the program.

**WELLNESS PROGRAM – T.E.A.M.** (Continued)

Ms. Macon expressed concern with the health of the community and indicated that a positive promotion could be offered which gives community leaders an opportunity to model it. She stated this was not only saving money for the Township, but also creating a healthy environment.

Mr. Herbert stated there will be a major reduction in the drug cost with a proposal that will be brought to the Township Board. This proposal will save an estimated \$150,000. Therefore, the wellness program could be funded with those savings.

Mr. Sher asked what he was seeking from the Committee. Mr. Herbert stated he wanted the Committee to review the proposal and hopefully make a recommendation to consider it at the 1/17/08 meeting.

Mr. Spector asked for a bottom line figure. Mr. Stuber stated it was difficult to provide a specific number because there were numerous variables to consider. He stated that they needed to look at claims data, which can be compared and contrasted over a two year period.

Ms. Macon suggested that when the proposal is brought back before the Committee, that it be cast in light of a future positive impact and a healthier community.

Mr. Spector asked if there was a percentage or ratio which could be reviewed. Mr. Stuber stated the company follows the philosophy of the University of Michigan Health Research Center and the model is that there is typically a \$3.50 to \$5.00 return on investment for every dollar spent. On a \$27,000 investment, it would result in a return of \$90,000 over a number of years because this is a long-term change that needs to be implemented within an organization in order to allow the benefits to occur.

Mr. Spector asked if this program would be optional to the employees. Mr. Hebert replied, "Yes." Mr. Spector asked if there was a way of monitoring the usage. Mr. Stuber stated there were a number of different components included in the program such as the on-site medical screening where nurses take a finger print blood draw and provide cholesterol level information for that individual as well as glucose information, blood pressure, and body mass index. An aggregate report will be provided by the company relative to the number of participants and what the Township scored on average. He stated there is also a health risk appraisal, which includes a 60 questionnaire on line that provides the overall wellness of a participant.

Mr. Stuber stated that participants will receive literature and a guide on how to self-medicate or treat themselves with an over-the-counter medication rather than going to see a physician. Therefore, it has the potential to impact claims dollars.

**WELLNESS PROGRAM – T.E.A.M.** (Continued)

Mr. Herbert stated this is a less expensive program and the motivational factor is an individual's own health. He stated the company would provide coaches for the participants and therefore, it allows an opportunity for a hands-on approach.

Mr. Stuber stated that programs work best with incentives and indicated that Oakland County offered \$100 to each individual who completed the medical screenings and health risk appraisal. He stated that another municipality offers each participant \$300 that can be used towards wellness related items. There are a number of different options, but incentive programs seem to work best.

Mr. Sher stated it would be helpful if the company provided letters of recommendation from organizations or municipalities that have used the program.

The Committee took a recess at 4:48 p.m. and reconvened at 4:55 p.m.

**JOB DESCRIPTION MODIFICATION – OFFICE COORDINATOR (WATER & SEWER DEPARTMENT)**

Mr. Herbert stated the department head wants to delete some of the duties in the current job description. The pay grade level is being reduced from level 6 to level 5 once the position is vacated by retiring employee, which negotiated within the union contract.

Mr. Sher asked about the Personnel Department's recommendation. Mr. Herbert indicated that he agreed with the proposal as outlined by the department head.

Mr. Spector noted there was a savings of approximately \$10,000.

**Motion by Mr. Sher and supported by Mr. Spector to recommend approval of the deletion of duties from the Office Coordinator job description as proposed by the department head.**

**Ayes: Sher, Spector**

**Nays: None**

**Absent: Macon**

**Motion carried**

**AUDIENCE GENERAL COMMENTS/QUESTIONS**

None.

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no other business before the Committee, the meeting adjourned at 4:58 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

*Marya Duncan*

Marya Duncan  
HR Specialist